| **Student Name:** Selina Ke |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that student evaluations and feedback should be the sole criteria for retaining a teacher’s employment |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Nice work on linking education to success. However, in your hook itself talk about how pivotal perception about teachers matters to this education and then to success. * You need to do some sort of work to make this process more fair. Talk about how you will take a representative sample of students and collect detailed feedback on specific things. Talk about how you will not let teachers influence this process. * Good work on showing that students are likely to know about teachers. You want to explain exactly the criteria they will use to evaluate certain teachers. * You need a better way to structure your argument. Try to highlight different arguments, prove them using multiple reasons and offer multiple mechanisms. This has to be visible in your speech. * Do not rely entirely on your notes. Try to maintain eye contact with your audience. * You need a lot more work to show why student evaluations are likely to be scientific. * Try to speak for longer.   3:40 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Melissa |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that student evaluations and feedback should be the sole criteria for retaining a teacher’s employment |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Nice work on showing that student evaluation is not linked to actual ability that teacher has. * Nice work on characterizing children. You want to explain why they will make bad decisions about the teachers. Explain what specifically affects their decision and how that will affect their educational outcome. * You don’t have to repeat the motion or indicate the end of the rebuttal. You also need more rebuttals in your speech. * Nice work on explaining how teachers will be careful about how students will judge them. You need to explain why this will lead to bad outcomes. Because it can make them better as well. * You need to characterize the power and vulnerability of the teachers and students in the classroom and how this can be weaponized to secure employment. * Nice work on explaining that we will have less interest in being a teacher because of this criteria. * Try to speak for longer.   3:50 | | | | | | |